



Meeting Agenda and Notice
FACT BOARD of DIRECTORS RETREAT
January 19, 2017, 8:00 a.m. - 1:00 p.m.
Vista City Hall, Vista Room
200 Civic Center Dr.
Vista, CA 92084

8:00 AM Light breakfast

8:30 AM PART A
MEETING CALL to ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS, REGULAR BUSINESS

1. Welcoming remarks
INFORMATION

Board Chair Dave Roberts & Retreat Planning Committee -
Board members Bob Campbell, LaVonna Connelly, and George Gastil

2. Public Comment **INFORMATION**

3. Approval of December 2016 Board Meeting Minutes
ACTION

4. Approval of 2017 Board Meeting Calendar
ACTION

9:00 AM PART B
Facilitator - Bob Campbell
FACT's PERFORMANCE, STRENGTHS, CHALLENGES

5. Review of survey responses from CAM and Brokerage Providers
INFORMATION

6. Service overview, what has gone well, what can be improved, challenges
POSSIBLE ACTION

- a. What has gone well** - RideFACT supply-demand, service quality, vendor relations, Brokerage
- b. What can be improved** - reporting, data, trip dispatching and scheduling, regional coordination
- c. Challenges** - Reliable funding, capacity, lack of awareness, taxicab regulations, transition to Routematch; LIFT contract transition

10:15 AM Break

10:30 AM PART C
Facilitator - Susan Hafner
OPPORTUNITIES FOR LONG TERM GROWTH AND
SUSTAINABILITY

**7. Contracted Services:
ACTION**

POSSIBLE

- a. **ADA paratransit subcontracting**
- b. **Municipal/Agency Dial-a-Ride Services**
- c. **Medical transportation contracts**

**8. New premium priced services including same day services
POSSIBLE ACTION**

**9. Other revenues sources/services for discussion
POSSIBLE ACTION**

11:30 AM Working Lunch

11:45 AM **PART D**
Facilitator - Dave Roberts
CTSA DISCUSSION

10. CTSA Contract Revisions

- Existing contract scope
- Rationale and vision for new contract
- Dispatch software implementation update

12:15 PM **CLOSED SESSION**

**11. Review of Contracted Service Issues
INFORMATION**

END OF CLOSED SESSION

1:00 PM **ADJOURNMENT**



FACT's Mission *Assist San Diego County residents with barriers to mobility to achieve independence through coordination of transportation services*

ITEM # 3**FACT Board of Directors Meeting Minutes**

December 8, 2016

Encinitas City Hall, Poinsettia Room
505 S. Vulcan Avenue, Encinitas, CA 92024

Board Members Attending	LaVonna Connelly, Susan Hafner, Phil Monroe, Hon. John Aguilera, William York, Hon. George Gastil
TAC Members Attending	Danielle Kochman, Lois Knowlton
Board Members Absent	Hon. Dave Roberts, Bob Campbell, Hon. Lorie Zapf
Staff Attending	Arun Prem, Meagan Schmidt, Budd Anderson, Julius Burgos
Public/Guests	See sign in sheet
Introductions	Treasurer Susan Hafner chaired meeting; called the meeting to order at 9:00AM. Introductions were made.
Public Comment, Driver Recognition	None
Approval of November Board meeting minutes	<p>Motion to approve the November 17, 2016 Board meeting minutes made by LaVonna Connelly. Second by Phil Monroe. The motion passed unanimously.</p> <p>Arun Prem reviewed FACT's new rider photos and a draft version of FACT's new marketing brochure. The purpose of the brochure was to market FACT's services to cities and agencies that provided rides for residents or clients. Phil requested that the safe and reliable portion in the sentence regarding fingerprinting and background checks be revised to more accurately reflect the intent of the two screening processes. Based on FACT's potential partnership with Lyft, FACT could no longer say that drivers were fingerprinted.</p>
Review of proposal for service coordination with Lyft	Arun reviewed past discussions regarding service coordination with Lyft. Meagan Schmidt reviewed Lyft's background check process, the detailed review of Lyft's Concierge agreement and FACT's brokerage contract with attorneys, and Lyft's agreement to address FACT's concerns in the contract. There was no commitment for a certain level of rides or a dollar

amount to maintain the agreement. The agreement was for a period of one year with an automatic renewal or a 30 day cancellation notice. She reviewed Lyft's insurance coverage in further detail. Bill York asked if Lyft would provide rides for FACT throughout San Diego County. Meagan indicated that Lyft would cover all of FACT's service area.

Danielle Kochman discussed a letter from FTA regarding partnering with Transportation Network Companies (TNC's). FTA was in favor of agencies partnering with TNC's, but cautioned regarding potential discrimination against low income or non-English speaking individuals who may not have a smart phone to book trips. She noted that using the Concierge service would resolve this issue. FTA also cautioned agencies regarding ADA compliance in offering same day service for ambulatory passengers, but not for non-ambulatory clients who used wheelchairs. ADA required parallel services for non-ambulatory users, but Lyft may not have wheelchair accessible vehicles to accommodate this. Arun reviewed the objective of having Lyft join FACT's brokerage and the limitations relying on current vendors. Phil discussed FACT's meeting with Yellow Cab and subsequent emails. Phil was hopeful that there is room for further negotiation with Yellow Cab and the Lyft contract may help.

Susan asked if Lyft's per mile rate was competitive with other brokerage vendors. Arun said Lyft offered their standard rate which fluctuated based on the time of day. He said staff performed test scenarios for different length trips to assess how Lyft's per mile rate compared to other vendors. Lyft's per mile rate was the lowest in all scenarios. Lyft does have surge pricing, but the cost is known up front. There is the option to look for other options in the brokerage if the cost is high. For the foreseeable future Lyft will be a small portion of the entire service and an enhancement to existing services. The Sterling background check is a comprehensive seven year check that will include SSN trace, criminal search, county court records, federal court records, Department of Justice sex offender registry, and credit reports. Danna Cotman was asked if FACT is at risk by only having a background check. She explained that Lyft is eager to work with FACT and willing to make adjustments to the contract. Danna will continue to push to protect FACT in contract negotiations. This is a mutually exclusive agreement with Lyft. Arun clarified how moving forward with Lyft will work and that board approval authorized him to sign the agreement subject to Danna's approval of contract language.

Motion to approve moving forward with Lyft made by John Aguilera. Second by LaVonna Connelly. The motion passed unanimously.

Board Retreat Planning Committee Appointment	<p>The retreat is confirmed for January 19, 2017 and the Annual Meeting is January 26. George Gastil, LaVonna Connelly, and Bob Campbell were appointed to the Board Retreat Planning Committee. Bill suggested data (identifiable, rolled up, demographic, usage, and client specific) as a topic of discussion at the retreat as well as how we measure success and what is important. Susan asked if we could also discuss the data that is available on the new software system, how that is matched with the old data, and how we follow through with comparative usable data.</p> <p>Motion to appoint George Gastil, LaVonna Connelly, and Bob Campbell made by John Aguilera. Second by Phil Monroe. The motion passed unanimously.</p>
FACT Services Updates	<p>Meagan provided an update on FACT services and reviewed service statistics for contracted services. October RideFACT data was not available at the time of the meeting. Tri-City discharge trips just began and the service is working well with Yellow Cab vouchers. FACT is working on a cost proposal for Sharp Coronado Hospital for discharge trips. FACT submitted a draft Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) to Palomar Health for review.</p>
Vehicle Sharing Status Updates	<p>Nothing to report.</p>
Monthly Financial Updates	<p>The monthly financial reports were available for Board review and Julius was available to answer any questions. Arun discussed some corrections needed on invoices to SANDAG and the corrective action taken. TDA audit was just finished. Danielle conducted her annual onsite FACT visit.</p>
Annual Meeting Jan 26 - Planning Committee Report	<p>The Planning Committee met after the last Board Meeting. Arun gave a brief overview. Specific recommendations were awards for Mayor Wood from City of Oceanside and Lois Knowlton. Other suggestions included requests for proclamations to the Cities, letters of appreciation, recognition to vendors, associations, video testimonial, show importance/true value of CAM, logos of vendors/CAM, and to hold a raffle. Chris Van Gorder, Scripps Health, is Keynote Speaker and will stay at meeting for an hour or as long as long as he can. LaVonna suggested sending out a survey to CAM Members to help highlight the importance and contribution of CAM.</p>
Executive Director's Report	<p>Arun said there will be an update next month with Yellow Cab. Arun discussed training for a certificate program Paratransit Transportation Management that Budd, Jonathan, and others are taking funded by Caltrans administered by CalACT mostly through a scholarship.</p>
Closed Session	<p>No formal action was taken during closed session.</p>

Adjournment	The meeting adjourned at approximately 11:00 AM.
-------------	--------------------------------------------------

ITEM # 4

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: Arun Prem, Executive Director, Budd Anderson, Grants Management Analyst

RE: Year 2017 Board Meeting and Retreat Calendar

ISSUE

Proposed Year 2016 FACT Board meeting calendar is enclosed for review and action by Board members.

Background:

According to FACT Bylaws, regular Board of Directors' meetings are held on the 4th Thursday of each month. Meeting dates are determined by the bylaws and approved by a majority vote of Board members. Alternate dates have been proposed to accommodate staff pto requested in March, and holiday schedules during the months of November and December.

2016 Board Meeting Dates (4th Thursdays, except during March, November and December)

Feb	23
Mar	30 *pto
Apr	27
May	25
Jun	22
Jul	27
Aug	24
Sep	28
Oct	26
Nov	16 *holiday schedule
Dec	14 *holiday schedule

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff requests Board approval for the proposed FACT Board meeting calendar for year 2017

ITEM # 5

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: Arun Prem, Executive Director, Budd Anderson, Grants
Management Analyst, Meagan Schmidt, Operations Manager**

RE: Survey of CAM and Brokerage Providers

(Staff is in the process of soliciting CAM and Brokerage providers for responses to surveys. A report will be presented during the meeting)

ITEM # 6

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: Arun Prem, Executive Director, Meagan Schmidt, Operations Manager

RE: Service Overview - what has gone well, what can be improved, challenges

ISSUE

Review of FACT Services over the long run and during the recently ended year 2016.

BACKGROUND

In 2010 FACT introduced its first transportation service in Ramona and Country Estates. The Ramona Pilot continued until 2011, when it was discontinued due to introduction of NCTD's demand response service in Ramona. FACT's service in Ramona was provided via the traditional third party contracting service model - the per trip cost was extremely high due to lack of competition and the deadhead cost of providing rides in Ramona using a vendor based in Carlsbad.

The Poway-Escondido-Rancho Bernardo RideFACT Pilot was implemented in January 2012; FACT also formed the Brokerage during this time in order to get competitive rates from participating vendors. In July 2012 brokerage based RideFACT was expanded to all the cities in the County and Ramona and the Country Estates.

Since then FACT has introduced contracted services and is now providing approximately 52% of its rides under agency contracts. The contracted services serve specialized transportation needs of organizations; contracts also help FACT generate revenue which can be used as general funds.

WHAT HAS GONE WELL

Demand for RideFACT rides

In Ramona FACT had established a target of 50 one-way rides as the monthly service goal. Despite extensive targeted marketing the demand for rides remained low for the duration of the service. Anecdotal evidence suggested that there was more unmet demand in Ramona for long distance rides compared to the *local* rides offered by FACT.

During the Poway-Rancho Bernardo- Escondido Pilot a similar demand issue presented itself. The demand was lower than anticipated and appeared that the service area limitation also limited demand for rides. Based on the feedback and demand patterns FACT's Board approved expansion of the service to all 18 Cities in San Diego County as of July 1, 2012.

RideFACT demand picked up after the service area expansion and continued to grow through 2015. After 2015 the ridership was relatively stable. The average demand in recent years represents max RideFACT service capacity due to funding constraints. Accordingly, FACT has not marketed its services widely.

Service Area Expansion

Covering diverse regions of San Diego County continues to be a challenge due to the concentration of taxicab businesses in the urbanized/densely populated areas of the County. It took several years for FACT to generate sufficient ridership to convince brokerage vendors to accept rides to/from Valley Center, Alpine and other outlying areas. FACT planned to assist existing and potential vendors in these regions with vehicles and guaranteed rides but despite the incentives there are still insufficient vendors based in those communities, making it more costly to serve residents. Today FACT is able to provide reliable coverage in all areas defined by SANDAG as urban and suburban, as well as a number of outlying/unincorporated areas. This is corroborated by FACT's growing average trip length - (11.9 miles in Nov 2016).

Service Quality

Riders have provided extensive anecdotal evidence in the form of comments sent via phone, email and letters indicating they appreciate the quality of FACT services. The survey of FACT contracted transportation sent to City of Oceanside residents has consistently ranked the service as 98% very good or good.

Performance of FACT Owned Vehicles

FACT owns (14/24) vehicles that are being shared with (5) local entities - (Safety First, Renewing Life, AGTS, Venture Medical, BAME CDC). These vehicles were awarded through USDOT capital grants. FACT makes the vehicles available to Brokerage members and partners for providing services to eligible special needs clients. Brokerage members utilize the vehicles as per the terms of the agreements with FACT. FACT receives free of cost rides from the partners using FACT vehicles as per the terms of each agreement. These rides generally accommodate those riders that require accessible vehicles, are hard to serve due to trip distance or other reasons.

Availability of new vehicles for coordinated services continues to be a draw for some brokerage vendors. There have been several issues associated with the coordination agreements involving FACT vehicles. The issues pertained to fluctuating demand for vehicles, vendor compliance with agreements, as well as FACT and vendor experience with administering these contracts.

At the present time (14 of the 24) the vehicles are in service and there are no contractual or other problems with the operation of these vehicles.

Brokerage

A brokerage provides the means to create capacity for rides without investing in the traditional infrastructure and expenditures - including but not limited to vehicles, garage

facilities, drivers and mechanics, fuel, insurance and maintenance. FACT's Board approved the Brokerage based service model after initial experience with third-party contracting which was cost prohibitive. FACT's first challenge was attracting vendors to join the brokerage and begin offering rides to FACT on demand for next day service. Since FACT did not have a track record of providing transportation, it involved educating vendors about the potential for new business due to the demand generated by FACT's outreach activities. The 5310 vehicles which FACT began to offer for sharing during that time helped attract some vendors to the Brokerage. In hindsight that timing of the FACT Brokerage implementation coincided with expansion of the shared ride services (UBER, Lyft etc.) that put pressure on the taxicab industry to lower rates as well as diversify their markets. It also coincided with a major brokerage company leaving NCTD's Lift Service which impacted a number of taxicab vendors.

Lower average per-trip cost

The brokerage helped FACT bring down average per trip costs from \$39.00 approximately in 2010 to \$15.66 in November 2016. FACT introduced a unique element in the Brokerage structure by encouraging nonprofits to become members. Some initial members like Alpha Project and Renewing Life offered extremely low rates that were unrelated to the cost of their transportation but presented a marginal benefit to them. The service models deployed by the nonprofit vendors were not profit oriented or related to expenditures, since their in-house services are provided free of cost to their clients. The additional paid trips offered by FACT offered a new revenue opportunity for the nonprofits. Unfortunately since Alpha Project left the brokerage the availability of nonprofit rides dropped sharply.

From a management perspective the brokerage presented several challenges. The challenges tend to be unique since FACT's brokerage is unique in terms of its size and structure. The typical transportation brokerages are national companies or operate at the State level to administer Medicaid transportation services.

Potential for Contracted Services

The Brokerage made it possible for FACT to enter into *fee for service* contracting arrangements with City of Oceanside and other agencies that have a constituent base that require transportation services. FACT purchases the rides from its brokerage and delivers them to Oceanside and other Contracted Services clients after adding a mark up to cover administrative expenditures and to generate revenue for FACT operations.

Currently FACT delivers approx. 1,230 contracted service rides monthly - this service capacity was generated without costly investments in capital and infrastructure, or operational expenses. There is growing demand for FACT's contracted services as evidenced by recent discussions with the medical services providers. FACT offers hospitals a convenient and cost effective transportation service module that improves overall business for the hospitals and improves the patients' experience.

Evolution of Services and compatibility with FACT's Mission

FACT sought help from the Service Development Committee and CAM as well as other stakeholders in determining the scope of services and service policies. RideFACT was

implemented as an unconstrained service for eligible riders. After discussions regarding means testing, trip purpose and trip limits, the Board recommended providing services without constraints, initially, in order to understand the nature of the demand. While demand grew rapidly as a result it was tempered by lack of marketing. For a few early months the demand for dialysis trips grew faster than overall demand. Over the longer term the demand for dialysis has subsided. Due to insufficient awareness about FACT services, demand has remained at projected budget levels.

The policies pertaining to fares have largely worked as planned – they are affordable and consistent with comparable services.

The ridership data shows FACT services being used in every City in San Diego. The riders use FACT as a complement to other services and resources in the region. The increasing trend in average trip length indicates FACT has been successful in meeting the unmet need for longer, inter-city rides.

Code of Conduct, No Shows/cancellations, fares

The quality of FACT's RideFACT as well as contracted services has been consistently good. Complaints and customer service issues are infrequent. Some serious rider conduct related service issues were discussed with the Board and addressed via an updated Code of Conduct and related policies. FACT provides a copy of the code of conduct to all new riders. The feedback from all contracted services has been overwhelmingly positive.

CAM

CAM members have remained active and committed. CAM meetings have high attendance and attract members as well as other stakeholders. The group has removed inactive members over time and replaced them with those who are involved; it has met its mission of reviewing regional coordination issues. FACT's Board recently recommended that a CAM representative attend the Board meeting and report on recent meetings and activities.

WHAT CAN BE IMPROVED

Issues with supply and demand - Limitations of Brokerage Capacity

The supply of rides in the brokerage has been dynamic – a function of FACT's demand projections subject to overall demand for rides. The supply fluctuates with market conditions and given the average small size of brokerage members it is difficult to increase in a timely fashion supply when demand projections trend upwards. An inherent drawback of the brokerage model is that FACT has no control over supply. FACT has tried to mitigate the situation by adding its own grant funded vehicles into the fleets operated by brokerage vendors. FACT owned vehicles are newer, and accessible for people with disabilities; overall they have been well received as a complement to the vendor fleets. They allow vendors to respond to more lucrative rider requests from people using wheelchairs and mobility devices. Due to the coordinating agreements that govern the use of the vehicles, FACT is also able to use them to meet the demand for accessible rides from RideFACT clients and its Contracted service clients. San Diego County has a shortage of accessible vehicles; they constitute less than a fraction of 1% of the taxicab vehicles operating in San Diego County.

Due to the limits of the Brokerage capacity FACT has had difficulty in committing to threshold levels of services that large programs require. While some of the contracted services were instrumental in increasing the capacity of the brokerage, the process was difficult because of FACT's inability to align the demand for trips with the supply. When demand for trips fluctuated the Brokerage vendors were unwilling to commit to maintaining supply levels at certain threshold levels. FACT declined a substantial number of trips requested under contracted services due to lack of supply. As we have gained experience and advanced overall brokerage participation, FACT's leverage as a contracted service provider has grown. In future contracted service agreements we intend to specify minimum guaranteed levels of rides to maintain the interest and commitment of FACT's Brokerage contractors. The services provided by FACT have been superior in quality and the positive perception has helped FACT attract additional interest in the services.

Integrating new service models - Yellow Cab and TNC's - in the Brokerage

In order to diversify FACT's contracted services as well as to serve the needs of the medical transportation service providers FACT needs to work with new vendors and find new service options. Currently the brokerage is comprised of predominantly small vendors - these vendors do not operate consistently on weekends and during nights. Yellow Cab is the only vendor who has countywide service coverage and capacity to provide rides 24/7. However Yellow Cab has an independent dispatch process that is not compatible with FACT operations and less predictable than the typical brokerage vendor's services. Yellow cab works with independent contractors who select the rides based on their individual preference and priorities, this causes a structural conflict compared with other brokerage vendors who work with employee drivers who can be directed to accept certain rides. Yellow cab drivers cannot be directed to accept trips but need to be incentivized to do so. Yellow cab has used different rates for different FACT services in order to match their capacity with FACT services. Yellow cab is working on some technological solutions like the "Yellow Button" and a portal similar to the TNC trip reservation process however FACT does not have access to those options. During 2016 FACT worked with Lyft to create another option in the brokerage which would help respond to the demand for medical rides. Lyft provides its partners with a Concierge portal which allows an administrator to make same day and advance reservations for clients. The administrator can monitor the trips for confirmation, pick-up, on time performance as well as real time GPS locations. FACT signed a coordination agreement with Lyft during 2016. The service will be tested in early 2017 in order to test compatibility with RideFACT and contracted services - if successful, Lyft will help meet demand for same day rides, short rides, late night and other rides that are challenging to provide through other brokerage vendors.

Difficulty in finding Software scheduling/dispatch solution

Finding a software solution for the reservation and automated dispatch of rides to vendors was a problem because the software vendors cater to the traditional brokerage structure. In a traditional design the brokerage vendors have negotiated rates and dedicated vehicles servicing specific contracts. With help from 211 FACT has procured a software solution that will be implemented tentatively in July 2017.

Vendor Turnover

FACT's brokerage began with a core group of vendors that quickly grew into a large group. Due to the evolving Brokerage based services some vendors were priced out, some were eliminated due to service quality issues and others due to issues with unrealistic expectations or contract compliance. Due to the interest in FACT the overall growth of the brokerage has continued. Currently small vendors particularly those with single vehicles are not admitted unless they fulfill a special need for service in a given area or operate accessible vehicles.

Vendor Relations

FACT has treated vendors fairly and equitably by strictly following its policy of providing most rides to vendors with the best prices. Vendors in turn have been increasingly reliable and consistent in providing services and tend to be partners in the programs and services FACT provides.

CHALLENGES

Administration and oversight of brokerage contracts and service contracts

The volume of contracts administered by FACT staff has continued to grow with the size of the brokerage as well growth in contracted services. The administration of the contracts involves oversight, invoicing and payments, compliance with contracts and grants. The administration of the contracts is a growing challenge with the current staffing. FACT currently has a part time accountant and a part time invoice analyst. As contracted service grow to include medical transportation services as well as other new accounts, a review of staffing and resources will be needed to ensure adequate support for the services.

Software Implementation

The transition to software based scheduling and dispatching expected in July 2017, will automate invoice generation, increase the accuracy of invoice data, making billing and payments more timely. The software will provide new options for optimizing services by enabling grouping of rides, optimizing the assignment of trip requests to appropriate brokerage vendors, determining the best price for each trip automatically. The riders will be able to get more reliable trip confirmations.

Transition to New NCTD LIFT Contract

First Transit's paratransit contract with NCTD ends in June 2017. The contract was bid in 2016 and a decision regarding the contractor as of July 1, 2017 is imminent. FACT has been in contact with all the proposers and has provided rate quotes to some of the providers. While it is anticipated that FACT will continue to play a role as subcontractor in the new NCTD paratransit service contract, the situation is uncertain from FACT's perspective. In anticipated of continuation of the service FACT has discussed the expected demand with brokerage vendors. FACT has 3 years experience in providing cost effective and compliant services under this contract and is positioned to play a larger role in future.

RECOMMENDATIONS

None

ITEM # 7

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: Arun Prem, Executive Director, Budd Anderson, Grants Management Analyst

RE: Contracted Services Opportunities

ISSUE

A discussion on the options and priorities for FACT's endeavors in providing services under contracts, as well the challenges and limitations.

BACKGROUND

Current contracted services were described under Item 6.

Due to recent enhancements in the capacity of FACT's brokerage, also covered under Item 6, the potential for providing additional contracted services increased significantly.

- The following contracted service areas present the greatest opportunity given the fit with FACT's mission and current capabilities:
 1. ADA Paratransit subcontracting, similar to First Transit contract
 2. Municipal Dial-a-Ride services similar to City of Oceanside Senior Van Service Contract
 3. Agency Services including Adult Day Health Care Centers, Braille Institute etc., similar to Poway service
 4. Medical Transportation contracting, pilot implemented with Tri-City, planned with Sharp Coronado, discussions with Palomar
- New marketing brochure for outreach purposes

DISCUSSION

1. **ADA Paratransit subcontracting.** NCTD and MTS are the largest paratransit service providers in the County. Their ADA paratransit services are provided by third party contractors. NCTD's agreements allow the contractors to subcontract for a portion of the services in order to make the overall service cost effective. NCTD has also used a purely brokered paratransit service model in the past using ALC as the contractor. MTS has recently experienced an increase in the demand for ADA paratransit rides which has a corresponding increase on cost. As discussed earlier FACT has developed additional capacity in the brokerage with the entry of new vendors. Additional ADA paratransit service contracts would help client agencies reduce costs. It also provides FACT with an opportunity to resolve its long term sustainability issue and limit reliance on discretionary grants for funding the basic level service and fixed expenses.

2. **Municipal Dial-a-Ride services.** A range of subsidized travel options are offered by various Cities in San Diego to assist the constituents, particularly seniors and persons with disabilities. The programs are not uniform/consistent. Many of them rely on taxicabs to perform the subsidized rides. The scrip options as well as contracted service options are available under these programs. Some Cities provide transportation assistance through Volunteer Driver programs. The Cities using contracted services or taxicabs to provide subsidized rides would benefit from FACT's negotiated rates that are substantially lower than the rates available to Cities or end users. FACT has developed a marketing brochure which will be mailed to all the cities as well as agencies that contract for transportation services for their clients.
3. **Agency Services.** During 2016 FACT had discussions with a range of social service providers including Adult Day Care, the Braille Institute, Seniors learning centers and many other agencies looking for sustainable and affordable transportation for their clients. In case of Adult Day Care providers the subsidies received are capitated and insufficient to pay market based rates for transportation. FACT has the option to provide rates that are competitive as well as affordable for some of the agencies. FACT will use its marketing brochure to reach out to agencies in the County and initiate the dialog on transportation needs.
4. **Medical Transportation contracting.** The Affordable Care Act created incentives for medical service providers to reduce hospital admissions and improve patient management by improving their access to appointments and resources. The incentives for the medical industry were a driver for higher investments in transportation. It is expected that the irrespective of the future of ACA, the new emphasis on transportation to healthcare will be sustained. FACT has initiated discussions with several hospitals in San Diego County to promote its services. FACT is positioned to provide cost effective, and streamlined services that assist hospitals in improving their operations. A pilot project with Tri-City was initiated during December 2016. FACT, Tri-City and SANDAG received a grant from Federal Transit Administration (FTA) which will fund an assessment of patient outcomes due to improved transportation. We had similar discussions with Palomar Health and Sharp Hospital.

RECOMMENDATION

None

ITEM # 8

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

**FROM: Arun Prem, Executive Director, Megan Schmidt,
Operations Manager**

RE: New premium priced services including Same Day Service

ISSUE

A discussion on developing serving options that are consistent with FACT's Mission and generate new/additional revenue.

BACKGROUND

Most Specialized service options in San Diego, including the Volunteer Drivers Services involve advance reservations, often 2 or more days before the travel date. There are no same day options for subsidized specialized rides for medical or other purposes. Currently FACT's policy is to refer people seeking immediate or same day transportation to taxicab companies.

From time to time same day services were discussed during FACT meetings, either in response to discussions with medical services providers or in response to needs in the community. The issue was moot until recently due to lack of any service options for same day or immediate trip needs.

With the availability of Yellow Cab (South) and Lyft services it is now possible to schedule rides on short notice and round the clock including weekends. Recently the First Transit ADA paratransit contract has been requesting increasing numbers of same day rides. An increasing numbers of these trip requests are being met by FACT. FACT's brokerage vendors who are qualified for NCTD's ADA paratransit (Yellow cab and Lyft are not available for NCTD services) have capacity for same day rides and have increasingly found it a benefit to accept these rides. It has helped FACT increase the overall volume of rides provided under the First Transit contract.

DISCUSSION

The current composition of the Brokerage provides an opportunity to offer same day rides to RideFACT users. The service could be priced as a premium service that costs more than next day RideFACT but less than a regular taxicab ride.

The pricing and compatibility with SANDAG grants will need to reviewed in detail.

The introduction of software based scheduling and dispatching (begin during Summer of 2017) is expected to make it easier to dispatch rides. The staffing issues related to expansion of service hours need to be discussed in detail as well.

Currently the Tri-City pilot project relies on Tri-City staff to handle the dispatching – the staff provides riders with a coupon which is presented by the rider to the taxicab driver. This process has yielded mixed results in the initial implementation. FACT does not have a way to accurately assess the number of rides offered – we rely on end of the month data provided by the taxicabs and there is no reconciliation mechanism at the moment. The issues are being discussed with Tri-City as well as the service provider in order to streamline the scheduling as well as the data.

RECOMMENDATION

None

ITEM # 11

TO: BOARD OF DIRECTORS

FROM: Arun Prem, Executive Director, Budd Anderson, Grants Management Analyst

RE: CTSA - Vision, Review of Potential Contract Revisions

ISSUE

FACT's Consolidated Transportation Services Agency (CTSA) contract with SANDAG was effective July 1, 2006. SANDAG plans to update the contract language as well as add goals and performance metrics to the scope of work in the contract.

This Item provides an opportunity for discussion on the Vision for the CTSA program. Some preliminary goals and metrics are also included for discussion.

BACKGROUND

The original SANDAG Contract serves as a CTSA Scope of work and an agreement for designating FACT as a recipient of 2% of the Section 4.5 funds (State funding) available in San Diego County. For FY 2016, that apportionment amounts to \$130,576.

In order to receive this TDA money, the consultant must file a TDA claim following the claim procedures policy manual provided by SANDAG. FACT files the claim annually; it includes a Work Plan including an itemized list of tasks and expenditures (handout - CTSA Claim and Workplan).

In the CTSA contract FACT's status is defined as a consultant and independent contractor.

The original contract envisioned an overall scope which was identical to the scope of CTSA services under State Government Code Sections 15951:

Regional Coordination and Consolidation activities:

- ~~1. Facilitation of combined purchasing to achieve cost savings among providers of social service transportation~~
- ~~2. Provision of consolidated driver training for social service transportation providers~~
- ~~3. Coordination of centralized maintenance of vehicles~~
- ~~4. Provision of transit travel training~~
- ~~5. Conduct ADA Paratransit/alternative transportation training~~
- 6. Provision of centralized dispatch of vehicles for social service providers**
- ~~7. Development of an administrative model that would eliminate numerous duplicative and costly administrative burdens~~

8. Identify and consolidate existing sources of funding for social service transportation to provide more effective and cost efficient use of scarce resources
 - Additional Provisions of the Scope included requirements pertaining to:
 - Maintain CTSA Database
 - Manage CAM meetings
 - Support SANDAG Coordinated Planning
 - Maintain STRIDE website
 - Conduct Annual Audits
 - Provide Annual Operations Report
 - Quarterly statistics consistent with regional reporting system
 - Update Business Plan Annually
 - Governing Board composition as per Contract
 - Expansion of coordination pilot to all County

Specific Insurance requirements in Contract

Commercial General Liability
 Automobile Liability
 Worker's Compensation/Employer Liability

No End date/term

The revision of the CTSA Agreement has been discussed over the past few years due to TDA Audit recommendations and general awareness that the language is outdated. A detailed review of FACT including the CTSA contract scope and performance was conducted by SANDAG during the year 2015-16. SANDAG provided FACT with the following recommendations based on the review:

Recent SANDAG Recommendations Regarding CTSA Agreement:

- SANDAG's agreement with FACT be modified to conform with the practice of having the SANDAG Board Chair appoint SANDAG's representative to FACT
- SANDAG's agreement with FACT be modified to reflect the activities that FACT actually performs in its role as the region's CTSA as differentiated from other FACT activities
- SANDAG's agreement with FACT be modified to include performance criteria and measures to implement activities relative to FACT's role as the region's CTSA - distinct from its role as a recipient of federal and *TransNet* funds allocated by SANDAG
- The Work Plan and budget submitted in support of FACT's TDA Article 4.5 claim clearly delineate agreed-upon CTSA activities, reconcile with the SANDAG agreement, and be accompanied by a summary of accomplishments funded by the previous year's claim
- The Transportation Committee and/or SANDAG Board of Directors receive periodic updates on FACT's performance as the region's CTSA

DISCUSSION

CTSA statutes which are reflected in the contract with SANDAG reflect the State's intent to optimize use of specialized transportation infrastructure through consolidation of services. The idea of consolidation of existing services was not feasible in most jurisdictions – therefore the CTSA's have typically followed the spirit of the CTSA regulations rather than the letter. The idea of consolidation of services was given up in favor of coordination of services which was relatively more feasible and appealing to stakeholders. The CTSA regulations are also open ended and therefore leave room for other options in addition to those mentioned in the regulations.

With respect to State CTSA regulations and original SANDAG Agreement scope, the two qualifying activities that are feasible in San Diego include:

- Provision of centralized dispatch of vehicles for social service providers
- Identify and consolidate existing sources of funding for social service transportation to provide more effective and cost efficient use of scarce resources

Both activities conform with the purpose and functioning of FACT's Brokerage. A Brokerage based transportation system was not envisioned by the State due to the age of the CTSA regulations (late 1970's and 80's). The brokerage set up by FACT coordinates services of 15 service providers including nonprofit services and uses the rides procured in this manner to serve the unmet needs in the region. The brokerage meets the intent of the CTSA regulations and provides the following benefits to the region:

- Increased availability of specialized/accessible trips
- Lower cost per trip
- Coverage of more suburban and rural areas of the County
- Expansion of hours and days of services

FACT is in the process of procuring software in order to manage the scheduling and dispatching of trips provided through the brokerage. The software is funded by an FTA VTCLI grant awarded to SANDAG, 211 and FACT. The annual licensing and maintenance expenditures are not covered by the grant.

Process for Revising CTSA Contract

1. Defining a CTSA vision
2. Differentiating CTSA Activities from Other Coordination; alternatively identifying a subset of CTSA activities funded by TDA
3. Discussion on CTSA in relation to FACT Services
4. Discussion on Goals and Metrics
5. Timeline
6. Leveraging FACT's Brokerage Software Implementation for reporting on CTSA services data

Based on the recommendation to include specific and non-duplicative services in the Workplan, other CTSA funded services could include:

- Routematch annual licensing and maintenance (6)
- Administration of CAM meetings and activities
- Maintenance of CTSA Database
- Grants management (8)
- Providing Referrals

RECOMMENDATION

None